

**INCLUDING NON-COGNITIVE OUTPUTS IN A
MULTIDIMENSIONAL EVALUATION OF EDUCATION
PRODUCTION: AN INTERNATIONAL COMPARISON**

**Marián García Valiñas
Manuel Antonio Muñoz Pérez**

De conformidad con la base quinta de la convocatoria del Programa de Estímulo a la Investigación, este trabajo ha sido sometido a evaluación externa anónima de especialistas cualificados a fin de contrastar su nivel técnico.

ISSN: 1988-8767

La serie **DOCUMENTOS DE TRABAJO** incluye avances y resultados de investigaciones dentro de los programas de la Fundación de las Cajas de Ahorros.
Las opiniones son responsabilidad de los autores.

INCLUDING NON-COGNITIVE OUTPUTS IN A MULTIDIMENSIONAL EVALUATION OF EDUCATION PRODUCTION: AN INTERNATIONAL COMPARISON*

Marián García Valiñas**

Manuel Antonio Muñiz Pérez***

Abstract

Non-cognitive education is recognized to be a significant objective on the same level as cognitive education. However, it has been neglected by previous studies that have analyzed efficiency in the education sector, which have exclusively focused on cognitive abilities. The main aim of the current study is to carry out, for the first time in the economic literature, a global evaluation of educational production. We have used information about both affective and cognitive outputs from a sample of 22 OECD countries. We find that there is a link between educational expenditures and affective outputs. However, the link is not clear in the case of the cognitive output. Additionally, the level of economic development of a country is a factor which has a positive influence on educational expenditure efficiency. Neither family support nor the presence of private schools are found to be significant factors in explaining the global efficiency of the education sector.

Keywords: affective education, productive efficiency, DEA

JEL Classification: H52, I21, H40, C61

* The authors would like to thank the Spanish Fiscal Studies Institute for their financial support for this research.

** Marián García Valiñas. Departamento de Economía. Facultad de Ciencias Económicas. Universidad de Oviedo. Avenida del Cristo s/n. 33071 Oviedo (Spain). E-mail: mariangv@uniovi.es

*** Manuel A. Muñiz. Departamento de Economía. Facultad de Ciencias Económicas. Universidad de Oviedo. Avenida del Cristo s/n. 33071 Oviedo (Spain). E-mail: manumuni@uniovi.es

1. Introduction.

There has been an increasing interest in the evaluation of the efficiency of public services, and in particular education, in all developed countries over recent decades. Bessent and Bessent (1980) was the first application of Data Envelopment Analysis (DEA), a non-parametric efficiency evaluation technique, to the educational sector. Since then there has been an ever-increasing number of studies analyzing specific problems related to the productive evaluation of education, addressing themes such as the effects of students' socio-economic and family environment or methodological issues surrounding the specification and estimation of the educational production function.¹ The elaboration of output measures has also been frequently analyzed, from both institutional and academic points of view (Gonand et al., 2007). However, up till now the non-cognitive component of educational output has been completely ignored in the literature.

When evaluating the efficiency of public services, the selection of the outputs is a decisive issue (Smith, 1997). Generally speaking, the identification and measurement of output variables should take into account both the social demands on public service and production targets. At the same time, the output variables should permit us to make a correct and fair evaluation of the productive units. The multidimensional character of education output has long been recognized (see, for example, Bloom et al., 1956). The education economics literature has highlighted two different components of the educational output: cognitive education (intellectual abilities and specific knowledge) and non-cognitive education (affective values and social and personal attitudes). Moreover, there is a consensus in the literature with regard to the significance of both these components of educational output in the sense that schools should not only transmit knowledge but also provide social and personal guidance which facilitate labour and social integration, the ability to communicate and interrelate, respect for the environment, and personal and socio-political responsibility (Pring, 1984; Lang et al., 1998; Best, 2003). The inclusion of several non-cognitive abilities as key aims of the educational

¹ See Worthington (2001) for a review of the literature related to the evaluation of the education sector efficiency.

system underscores the high value that societies attributes to affective education.

However, as far as we are aware, there are no studies that have evaluated the efficiency of the education sector taking this non-cognitive component into account. Our aim in this research is to provide an empirical analysis which includes non-cognitive outputs jointly with cognitive output. To do so, we carry out an international comparison of efficiency in the educational sector which allows us to identify differences among countries and institutional frameworks with respect to both educational output dimensions.² The data used to design the non-cognitive output measures have been taken from the *World Values Survey* and the *European Values Survey*. We have made use of several questions in these surveys related to affective education, focusing on the population aged between 15 and 20 years old. To measure cognitive skills we use the PISA data base. The methodology used for the efficiency evaluation is DEA, which is the technique generally used for analyzing efficiency in the educational sector in studies which have considered only the cognitive dimension.³ In the last part of our empirical exercise we study the impact on results of several country features such as the economic level, the presence of private schools in education, and family support for teenagers' education.

The outline of the paper is the following. In the next section, some comments about the importance and role of affective education are made. The following three sections relate to the empirical analysis: Section 3 includes the description and calculation of variables; the methodology used and the results obtained in the efficiency evaluation are presented in Section 4; and Section 5 presents the results of the second-stage analysis. Section 6 concludes.

² The authors are conscious that aggregate results obtained in an international comparison have to be taken cautiously, due the differences in historical evolution, social composition, etc. However, this does not take away from the importance of published studies (some of them cited in this research) which compare the productive efficiency of different national educational systems. In an effort to achieve homogeneity, we include exclusively OECD countries in our sample.

³ See the aforementioned literature review by Worthington (2001).

2. Affective or non-cognitive education: its role in the productive evaluation of educational service

Despite the fact that the relevance of both cognitive and non-cognitive results has long been recognized in the education and teaching literature, non-cognitive features have been ignored in the empirical literature related to educational sector inputs and output. Affective education can be defined as learning that is related to emotions, feelings and passions which motivate and have influence on human actions (Best, 1998). Cohn et al. (1975) proposed the following classification of the most important aspects linked to affective education:

- Self-esteem and environment control.
- Tolerance and respect towards other social groups.
- Citizenship (democratic attitudes and responsibilities).
- Interest in school tasks.
- Healthy lifestyle.
- Potential creative abilities.
- Labour career development.
- Valuation of human achievements (theatre, fine arts, sports, music, science, politics).
- Adaptation to changes.

In the previous list, the first three groups have been especially highlighted in the educational literature, in particular the following: those aspects related to individual features, such as effort, responsibility or self-confidence; features linked to tolerance and personal relationships; and active citizenship (politics, democracy). These are the features which will be considered when selecting affective output variables in the empirical analysis. However, according to Cohn and Geske (1990) it is easier to distinguish between different types of educational outputs than it is to accurately measure them. They point to the difficulty in reaching agreement on the definition of some basic concepts. Thus, while it may be difficult to define the concept of "citizenship", it is just as difficult to define basic knowledge in Mathematics or Language as there are different exams to measure cognitive abilities. However, the controversy about

a generally accepted definition of citizenship has not impeded agreement on several basic concepts such as race or sexual discrimination or certain individual characteristics such as effort or responsibility.

One of the main problems in the characterization of non-cognitive education is how to achieve equilibrium in the sense of setting priorities among interdependent objectives (Ryder and Campbell, 1988). In this respect, some researchers consider that the main aim should consist of identifying a “well-behaved person”. For others, the basic issue would be “ethical features”, in terms of relationships with other people (Pring, 1984). Finally, several researchers place greatest emphasis on socio-political and democratic attitudes (Hargreaves et al, 1988). However, all these issues are clearly complementary.

According to Atkinson and Hornby (2002), the practices and techniques that improve emotional intelligence have a life-long impact on students and for this reason social and emotional aspects are at least as important as cognitive aspects, if not more so. Several studies suggest that when affective learning has been actively developed, there are important short and long-term consequences for both academic and affective dimensions. For example, the development of cooperation and interaction among groups of students leads to improvements in the environment for learning. This generates better academic outcomes and greater social capital in terms of the ability to integrate and be committed to future social collectives (Watkins et al, 1991; Nixon et al, 1996).

In spite of the above, all of the studies published to date have focused on output variables related only to the cognitive component, constructed using student exam marks (Worthington, 2001). Moreover, few studies have analyzed the efficiency of the education sector from an international perspective (Wilson, 2005; Afonso and St. Aubyn, 2006; Giménez et al., 2007). The problem with carrying out such studies has been a shortage of data and the main reason why non-cognitive outputs have not been considered in empirical studies is the difficulty in obtaining standardized indexes to measure affective abilities (Gray et al., 1986).

Levin (1974) pointed out that care should be taken when interpreting the results of studies where only cognitive outputs are considered. Schools are multi-objective productive units in that they have to ensure that students not only learn specific subjects but also acquire several socio-affective attitudes.

Several original studies that applied DEA to the educational sector (Bessent and Bessent, 1980; Bessent et al., 1982) concluded that one of the three main problems with evaluating efficiency in this context is to get data which allow the construction of output variables which are not restricted to cognitive results. In addition, Smith and Mayston (1987) pointed out that the omission of a significant output can clearly bias the results. According to the experts in this sector, the best solution would consist of complementing cognitive outputs with other abilities and values related to affective or non-cognitive outputs (Gray, 1981; Thanassoulis and Dunstan, 1994; Rico, 1996; Silva Portela and Thanassoulis, 2001; Giménez et al., 2007).

On the other hand, it is possible to find arguments against the inclusion of these kinds of variables in the evaluation of schools (Wagner, 1977; Madaus et al, 1979; Chubb and Moe, 1990). First of all, it has been argued that non-cognitive outputs have less importance than cognitive outputs. Secondly, schools are held less responsible for the transmission of these values. And finally, there is a higher probability that these non-cognitive outputs have been nurtured outside schools. However, nowadays the social structures of developed societies are changing in ways which influence young peoples' affective education. Several phenomena such as the lengthening of the workday, the incorporation of women into the labor market, the lack of conciliation between family and work⁴, new forms of personal interaction due to new technologies, and the increase in immigration⁵ all exert a strong influence on non-cognitive formation. As a consequence, in recent years politicians have been concerned with young peoples' attitudes with respect to social and democratic integration, tolerance, or other affective abilities. Governments have attempted to facilitate informal education at home through legal measures to conciliate labour with family, but at the same time they are trying to complement family efforts by reinforcing the role of the schools in improving young peoples'

⁴ According to 2007 data from Spain's Department of Labour and Social Affairs, half of Spanish grandmothers spend an average of 4 hours a day looking after their grandchildren while their parents are working.

⁵ In Janmaat (2008) is shown that the civic values and attitudes previously mentioned are not exclusively observed in occidental cultures. In the context of an international study, he concludes that the differences between national and immigrant teenagers are based on different socioeconomic conditions, and not on their ethnic origin.

affective education. This makes it all the more important to consider non-cognitive outputs in the evaluation of educational units.

3. Empirical analysis: data and variables.

In line with the discussion in the previous section, we now describe the variables related to affective abilities which have been included in the empirical analysis. The indexes have been calculated using micro-data taken from the *World Values Survey* and the *European Values Survey*. These surveys are the result of multi-country research into socio-cultural and political change based on representative individual national samples. Data from these surveys are made publicly available for use by researchers interested in how views change with time. We have used the information corresponding to the 1999-2001 wave due to the greater homogeneity and breadth of the questionnaire for our purposes, as well as the greater availability of countries.⁶ For each country we have selected those individuals between 15 and 20 years old, and in total we have selected 22 countries, all of which are OECD members⁷.

From the questionnaire, nine questions related to non-cognitive education have been selected. The first block includes relevant student qualities or virtues such as effort (EFF), responsibility (RESP) and perseverance (PERSV). In the survey, students are asked whether they consider these features to be important in a person's education.⁸ Their descriptive values are presented in Table 1, from which it can be discerned that the students interviewed considered responsibility to be more important than effort or perseverance. On average, the value related to responsibility is almost double those of effort and perseverance.

⁶ As we will show below, the years of the survey are not exactly the same for all the countries included in our sample.

⁷ The countries considered and the exact year when the corresponding survey was carried out are the following: Austria (1999), Belgium (1999), Canada (2000), Republic of Korea (2001), Czech Republic (1999), Denmark (1999), United States (1999), Finland (2000), France (1999), Germany (1999), Greece (1999), Hungary (1999), Ireland (1999), Iceland (1999), Italy (1999), Luxembourg (1999), New Zealand (1998), Poland (1999), Portugal (1999), Spain (1999-00), Sweden (1999), and the United Kingdom (1999).

⁸ The three questions included in this block are dummy variables (0 = not important; 1= important). The common framework of questions was the following: "Here is a list of qualities that children can be encouraged to learn. Which, if any, do you consider to be especially important?"

Table 1. QUALITIES ranking: selected values.

	EFF	RESP	PERS
1°	S. KOREA (0.67)	S. KOREA (0.91)	GREECE (0.65)
2°	PORTUGAL (0.62)	GREECE (0.86)	CANADA (0.56)
3°	UNITED STATES	GERMANY (0.86)	UNITED STATES (0.56)

20°	SWEDEN (0.07)	UNITED KINGDOM	ICELAND (0.23)
21°	GERMANY (0.06)	NEW ZEALAND	SWEDEN (0.21)
22°	AUSTRIA (0.04)	IRELAND (0.50)	AUSTRIA (0.19)
MEAN	0.37	0.74	0.41
STD. DEV.	0.19	0.11	0.12

Source: own elaboration

Secondly, regarding tolerance towards different social groups we have considered three additional questions. Individual were asked about their willingness to share their daily space with different collectives, such as people of different races (RACE), immigrants (INM), and homosexuals (HOMO).⁹ Table 2 shows the main descriptive statistics. The lowest-valued social collective is that of homosexuals, with strikingly low minimum values in some countries.

Table 2. TOLERANCE ranking: selected values

	RACE	INM	HOMO
1°	NEW ZEALAND (1.0)	NEW ZEALAND (1.0)	ICELAND (0.98)
2°	AUSTRIA (0.97)	IRELAND (1.0)	SWEDEN (0.96)
3°	ICELAND (0.97)	PORTUGAL (0.98)	DENMARK (0.95)

20°	ITALY (0.84)	ITALY (0.79)	HUNGARY (0.64)
21°	FINLAND (0.83)	CZECH REP. (0.79)	POLAND (0.60)
22°	S. KOREA (0.82)	S. KOREA (0.64)	S. KOREA (0.29)
MEAN	0.91	0.89	0.81
STD.	0.05	0.08	0.15

Source: own elaboration

The third and final block is related to valuations of citizenship and democracy. Interviewees were asked about their interest in politics (INT), and we included two additional questions related to the individuals' valuation of

⁹ As with the previous block, the three questions included here are dummy variables. To the following question: "Would you have a problem with having a member of the following collective as a neighbour?", the interviewee could answer: 0 = no or 1= yes. We have re-codified the variable inversely.

democratic systems. In particular, we include the interviewees' opinion about the idea that democracies are good for maintaining order (DEMO1), and their opinion about whether they think democracy, even if they recognize that it is not perfect, is the best alternative, (DEMO2).¹⁰ In Table 3 it can be observed that, on average, young people have faith in democratic systems but they are not much interested in politics.

Table 3. POLITICS ranking: selected values

	INT	DEMO1	DEMO2
1º	GERMANY (0.58)	S. KOREA (0.90)	GREECE (0.97)
2º	UNITED STATES	SWEDEN (0.87)	AUSTRIA (0.97)
3º	AUSTRIA (0.47)	ICELAND (0.84)	S. KOREA (0.96)

20º	POLAND (0.22)	CZECH REP. (0.57)	CANADA (0.84)
21º	FRANCE (0.21)	FRANCE (0.56)	UNITED STATES (0.77)
22º	FINLAND (0.20)	POLAND (0.40)	UNITED KINGDOM
MEAN	0.35	0.73	0.89
STD.	0.10	0.12	0.06

Source: own elaboration

As is well-known, the use of DEA requires a high number of productive units compared with the number of variables included in the analysis in order to correctly identify the efficient units. Taking into account the sample size, it is therefore necessary to aggregate the information. Principal Components Analysis has sometimes been used in the literature to achieve this. However, making use of the homogeneity inside each of the three blocks/groups, we have used the simpler method of obtaining one variable per block by summing up the values of the three questions in each block. We thus summarize the information from nine questions into three variables which are representative of affective education. Table 4 shows some descriptive statistics related to these non-cognitive outputs.

¹⁰ The three questions in this block have a scaled response from 1 to 4. For example, to the question "How interested would you say you are in politics?" the interviewee could answer 1= very interested, 2= somewhat interested, 3 = not very interested, 4= not at all interested. In order to homogenize this variable, responses were re-coded into a dummy variable: 1= if individual is very interested or somewhat interested, and 0= if he/she is not very interested or not interested at all.

Table 4. Descriptive statistics: affective and cognitive outputs

	<i>MEAN</i>	<i>STD. DEV.</i>	<i>MAX.</i>	<i>MIN.</i>
Y1 (QUALITIES)	1.52	0.26	2.12	1.00
Y2 (TOLERANCE)	2.63	0.25	2.93	1.76
Y3 (POLITICS)	1.98	0.21	2.32	1.49
Y4 (PISA)	501.22	24.73	546.00	441.00

Source: own elaboration

Regarding cognitive output, we have used the information from the PISA international report for the year 2000, which corresponds to the period of the affective data. The OECD Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) tries to evaluate several aspects of the knowledge and abilities of students who are close to finishing obligatory secondary school. PISA tests are carried out every three years, and in each wave there is a specific area: *Reading* (in 2000), *Mathematics* (in 2003) and *Sciences* (in 2006), with problem-solving being a specific topic in PISA 2003. The programme is carrying out a second phase of evaluations in 2009 (*Reading*), 2012 (*Mathematics*) and 2015 (*Sciences*). The main area in each wave takes up approximately 66% of the study, with the two remaining areas accounting for 17% each. This permits a broad and detailed view about students' education every nine years, with an approximation to their evolution every three years. As we are using the 2000 report, we will use the results related to *Reading* as it was the main area of that wave.¹¹ Some descriptive statistics of our cognitive output are shown in Table 4.

Having identified and defined the output variables, the task remains of choosing the input variables to be used in the educational production process. The study of the impact that physical and human resources have on school outputs has traditionally been a central topic in the literature. However, the proliferation of studies on this issue has not yielded clear-cut evidence on the relationship between schools' resources and outputs.¹² Despite the lack of agreement on the existence of a significant relationship between educational

¹¹ For more detailed information about the PISA reports and the design of the 2000 wave, see Adams and Wu (2002).

¹² For a classic view about the topic, see Hanushek (1986). The same author points out in Hanushek (1998) that the weak relationship that is sometimes detected between school resources and results is a consequence of the current organization and incentives framework at schools. Thus, resources matter, but the problem is that they are not always well used.

expenditure and outcomes, this should be interpreted with caution due to the problems surrounding this issue.¹³ It is thus quite dangerous to conclude that schools' resources do not have any impact on students' learning and abilities, and school expenditure is generally used as an input in analyses of efficiency in the education sector.

In accordance with the previous literature, therefore, we use the education expenditure per student as the input variable, considering this an index of the relative effort that governments make in order to improve young people's education. Here, we have a choice between two alternatives: the expenditure corresponding to the year of the survey, or the average value of this expenditure over the period 1998-2001. If we compare this average with the value of the year in which the survey was carried out, a strong correlation is observed. To make use of the greatest information possible we decided to use the average. Table 5 shows the statistics, where the data have been taken from the OECD, the IMF and EUROSTAT. We observe a high dispersion in the values, ranging from 2,500 euro per student in the case of Denmark to around 300 euro in the case of South Korea or Poland.

**Table 5. Descriptive statistics: relative public expenditure in Education
(average 1998-2001)**

	MEAN	STD. DEV.	MAX.	MIN.
EXP (euro per student)	1,062.24	543.48	2,530.63	318.79

Source: OECD, IMF, EUROSTAT

Given the lack of consensus in the literature, before turning to the application we explore the relationship between expenditure and outputs. Regarding affective output, we find significant and positive correlations with two of the three variables (tolerance and democratic values). For the variable related to personal features, the correlation is positive but not significant. We determined that this result was produced by the outlying values of three

¹³ According to Hanushek (1986), the lack of statistical significance can reveal problems with the data. Goldhaber and Brewer (1997) point out that the majority of studies have methodological deficiencies. Along the same lines, Hedges et al. (1994) and Dewey et al. (2000) have questioned the irrelevance the impact of resources on educational results. The debate remains open.

countries of the sample.¹⁴ Eliminating these values, the correlation becomes significant and positive. To complement the above analysis, we constructed an aggregate variable by summing up the values of the three affective outputs and found a positive and significant correlation between this aggregate affective output and educational expenditure. However, the relationship between expenditure and cognitive output is not clear, in that we found a positive but non-significant relationship between both variables. This result is in line with previous studies.

4. Methodology and results

The methodology we use to evaluate affective education production efficiency is Data Envelopment Analysis (DEA). This non-parametric technique is especially suited to analyzing efficiency in the education sector.¹⁵ DEA, based on mathematical programming, has evolved significantly since it originally appeared in the paper by Charnes et al. (1978). Thus, several extensions of the basic methodology have since appeared, adapting the original technique to the features of different sectors, to the nature of the variables used, or to the objectives involved.¹⁶

In this study, we have applied the variable returns to scale DEA model (Banker et al., 1984), oriented to output maximization. Variable returns to scale methodology is more flexible than other specifications, and it is especially appropriate for the educational sector where modeling the production process is complicated. However, higher flexibility is usually correlated with lower ability to discriminate when the number of observations is not high. In spite of this inconvenience, we have preferred to use variable returns over the alternative of constants returns to scale, the latter being a very restrictive assumption in the context of the education sector.¹⁷ On the other hand, the objective of output maximization is perfectly appropriate in the context of current educational

¹⁴ These countries were Austria, Sweden and Denmark, where the educational expenditure and two dimensions of affective output (tolerance and democratic values) have high values. However, very low values were reported for the question related to effort as a necessary quality in individuals' education.

¹⁵ For a review of the advantages of this technique in the context of education, see Worthington (2001).

¹⁶ See Cooper et al. (2004) and Thanassoulis (2001).

¹⁷ In fact, where possible, variable returns to scale model is unanimously applied in the literature.

policies, in that the aims of public policies with regard to education are usually focused on maximizing the results obtained from assigned resources rather than saving resources maintaining the output level.

One final methodological decision needs to be taken. As we mentioned above, we consider four output variables: three linked to affective output and one to cognitive output. If we directly include the four outputs in the analysis, we would implicitly be giving more weight to affective education over cognitive education. As we want neither to predominate, one way of providing more symmetry between the outputs would be to aggregate the three affective variables into one. However, as this option would lead to a significant information loss, we rejected it in favour of applying an extended DEA model based on weight restrictions.

The enormous flexibility of DEA allows the assignment of null weights to some outputs, thereby permitting the construction of global indicators based on only one educational dimension, ignoring the remaining dimensions. However, this procedure is not appropriate if all dimensions are held to be important. As an alternative to completely free weights, it is possible to assign a specific weight to each output variable. This would allow us to obtain a global index by a simple ratio analysis, but the entire flexibility of model disappears and the weight-setting would in any case be subjective. As an intermediate alternative between these extremes (free or fixed weights), there exists an extension of DEA which has been commonly applied in recent years: the weights restriction model.¹⁸ The aim of this technique is to avoid the efficiency evaluation being based on only one or a few of the variables considered in the analysis. Thus, we can avoid an excessive specialization by imposing minimum and maximum weights for all the variables included. In this way, and depending on the selected constraint, it is possible to guarantee that all dimensions be considered in the global index. While maintaining the flexibility of the DEA model, the mechanism selects the value of each weight that maximizes the value of each individual index.

¹⁸ This extension was initially proposed by Dyson and Thanassoulis (1988). On its evolution and the extensions to the model, see Allen et al. (1997).

Having justified the methodology used, we need to restrict the weights in the most appropriate way. In our case, two aims were simultaneously pursued. First, we wished to ensure that the cognitive output did not have a very different weight from affective output, and to do so we assigned weights ranging from 40% to 60%. Secondly, we wanted to ensure that the three dimensions of affective output played a role in the evaluation. To achieve this, we assigned weights between 10% and 30% to each affective variable.

In analyzing the results, we focus on two aspects: the identification of efficient units and the values obtained by inefficient units.

As can be observed in Table 6, four countries of the total sample (22) are efficient: Canada, Ireland, South Korea and New Zealand. These countries maximized affective education given their resources but there are differences between them. On the one hand, South Korea and Ireland have a low level of expenditure per student but they obtained above average values in all the output variables.¹⁹ Canada and New Zealand, on the other hand, are closed to the average expenditure but they are in the top positions in all the output rankings. DEA identified Canada (14 appearances) and Korea (13 appearances) as the reference models for each of these two different types of efficient behavior.

The average efficiency index corresponding to inefficient units is around 0.95, implying that there are not large differences among countries and that there is not much scope for improvements in results²⁰. The precise interpretation of the efficiency index value is that it shows the potential radial improvement of all the variables considered simultaneously (i.e., in an output maximization model it implies that, on average, inefficient units could improve all their outputs by 5%, maintaining their expenditure constant). However, the index does not provide information about non-radial slacks, which are quite large for some inefficient units especially in relation to individual qualities²¹ and input²² variables. Some countries such as the United States, Germany, Spain,

¹⁹ There is an exception regarding one dimension in each country: the output related to personal qualities in the case of Ireland, and the results linked to tolerance in the case of South Korea.

²⁰ Luxembourg registers the minimum efficiency index value (0.90).

²¹ This is, for instance, of Sweden (potential improvement of 84%), Austria (64%) or Poland (37%).

²² Denmark (66%) and Sweden (48%) are the countries with highest slacks in this variable.

Italy or Hungary have very low or null slacks, so their potential improvements are almost exclusively in terms of their radial component.

Table 6. DEA results.

COUNTRY	EFFICIENCY INDEX
REPUBLIC OF KOREA	1.00
IRELAND	1.00
CANADA	1.00
NEW ZEALAND	1.00
ICELAND	0.99
FINLAND	0.98
UNITED STATES	0.98
PORTUGAL	0.98
GERMANY	0.98
SPAIN	0.97
CZECH REPUBLIC	0.97
GREECE	0.97
AUSTRIA	0.96
UNITED KINGDOM	0.96
DENMARK	0.95
SWEDEN	0.95
HUNGARY	0.95
BELGIUM	0.94
FRANCE	0.94
POLAND	0.94
ITALY	0.94
LUXEMBOURG	0.90

5. Analysis of explanatory factors: second stage analysis

In order to extend our empirical study, we carry out a second stage analysis. This kind of analysis, which is very common in studies that evaluate economic and technical efficiency²³, consists of finding explanatory factors for inefficient behaviour. To do so, it is frequent to use regression analysis (generally a Tobit, as the efficiency indexes are censored), using as a dependent variable the value of the efficiency indexes obtained in the first stage and as independent variables certain environmental factors (institutional, legal,

²³ In the education sector, the study by McCarty and Yaisawarng (1993) was the first to carry this out. Nowadays, this is a generalized procedure in research in this field.

etc). If these factors are found to be statistically significant, it can be concluded that they contribute to explaining inefficient performance.²⁴

For our second stage analysis we selected three factors which considered relevant in explaining why educational expenditures lead to better or worse relative results. First of all, and as mentioned in the introduction, we consider the role of family support in teenagers' education. As we have included affective outputs as part of the global educational output, it seems appropriate to check whether the importance that society gives to family life has a significant complementary effect on educational results. To test this, we use the information from the replies to two questions in the surveys considered in the previous empirical exercise (*World Values Survey* and *European Values Survey*), using the values for all individuals (i.e., of all ages): the first refers to the importance of family in the interviewee's life (*FAM1*), and the second is the interviewee's valuation of whether it is positive to pay more attention to family life (*FAM2*).

The other explanatory variables selected are the income level and the proportion of students in private schools. Both factors have theoretical support (more unanimous in the first case than in the second) as potential explanatory features of educational success. Regarding socioeconomic characteristics, the literature has shown the socioeconomic environment to be the factor with most weight in explaining educational results. To evaluate this effect, the explanatory variable used was the per capita income level (*INCO*) in each country in US dollars. With respect to private schools, there are several studies which support

²⁴ The literature of the distinction between environmental factors and non-controllable inputs can be somewhat confusing. Sometimes they are used synonymously, but their methodological treatment in an efficiency evaluation exercise should be different. The first group refers to exogenous factors which do not have a role as input/output variables but which have an influence in explaining efficiency results. As such, they should be included in a second stage analysis. The second group comprises inputs in the production process (in that they are positively correlated with outputs) whose value is not decided by the producer. Thus, they should be included in the first stage (DEA analysis). However, the classification into one group or the other is often not easy. The family support variables in our study are a case in point. To resolve this doubt, we tested their correlation with the output variables. As we did not find any correlation, we finally included them as environmental factors.

the superiority in efficiency terms of private over public education.²⁵ Thus, we include the percentage of pupils in each country who study in public schools (PUBL). Information on both variables has been taken from OECD statistics.

Table 7. Second stage results

Variable	Coefficient	t-Statistic
<i>CONST</i>	51.91	1.49
<i>FAM1</i>	28.12	0.78
<i>FAM2</i>	10.52	0.91
<i>INCO</i>	135.13*	1.77
<i>PUBL</i>	4.91	1.43

* Significant at 10% level

Source: own elaboration

The results of the second stage analysis are shown in Table 7. It can be observed that some factors, such as family support and the relative presence of private schools, do not have a significant impact on results.²⁶ However, the variable linked to the socioeconomic environment is significant, in accordance with the results of previous studies. In those countries with a higher income level, student learning is made easier in both the cognitive and affective dimensions. This is the reason they obtain higher returns from their public educational expenditures than other countries with lower income levels.

²⁵ The discussion about public-private management in education began with the study by Coleman et al. (1982). In this study, using educational return equations they conclude that private schools were more effective than public ones in training students, even after controlling for socioeconomic differences. Further studies have focused on evaluating the net quality of different samples of public and private schools, once all extreme variables which condition school production are eliminated. The conclusions obtained by this literature are mixed. On one hand, some studies reaffirm the findings of Coleman et al. (Chubb and Moe, 1990, Jiménez et al., 1991; Bedi and Garg, 2000). On the other, the superiority of private schools either disappears when some controls are included into the analysis (Goldhaber, 1996; Sander, 1996), or is reduced to some specific output dimensions (Williams and Carpenter, 1991) or groups of students (Figlio and Stone, 1997). For a review, see Mancebón and Muñiz (2008).

²⁶ The lack of explanatory power of family variables reinforces the idea of the growing role of schools as complementary support in social and affective values. However, the non-significant role of private schools is not surprising given the disagreement in the literature regarding the results of private and public schools.

6. Summary

The interest in evaluating the efficiency of the educational sector has increased in recent years. This sector, along with health, is one of the most researched fields in public economics. However, despite the importance given to non-cognitive outputs in the analysis of educational outcomes, this kind of variable has been omitted in previous empirical studies. This study tries to remedy this by defining and measuring several non-cognitive outputs, and then using them to analyze the relative efficiency of educational production taking into account both cognitive and affective outputs.

The data used to obtain the non-cognitive outputs have been taken from the *World Values Survey* and *European Values Survey*. In accordance with the theoretical literature, three blocks of questions have been selected. These are related to personal qualities, such as effort, responsibility and perseverance; to tolerance and group interactions; and to active citizenship and democratic values.

After commenting on some of the more interesting features of the results on non-cognitive education in our sample, we analyze the relationship between public educational expenditure and cognitive and non-cognitive results. In our sample, the relationship is positive and statistically significant for the case of affective education. However, in the case of the cognitive output, the relationship is positive but non statistically significant, being this result a usual finding obtained from each country's PISA results.

We carry out an international comparison. From our results from the first stage of the empirical analysis (DEA evaluation) we do not observe a high dispersion of the efficiency indexes. However, our analysis shows that several countries could achieve significant improvements in some outputs, especially when we focus on the non-radial component. We identify the best performing or reference countries, which is Canada in the group of countries with a high level of educational expenditure, and South Korea in the group with a low level of educational expenditure.

In a second stage empirical analysis we selected three features which we considered could have an impact on educational results in the sense of being explanatory factors of inefficient/efficient performance: the importance of family life (as a support for teenagers' affective education), the socioeconomic

environment (the most important factor according to the previous literature) and the proportion of students in private schools (to test whether they obtain higher efficiency levels than those in public schools). Our results show that the socioeconomic environment is the only significant factor in explaining efficient behaviour.

We finish by proposing two possible future extensions of this study. First of all, we would like to carry out a dynamic analysis in order to get more consistent results. Secondly, we would like to try to obtain more information on variables related to affective education in order to extend the analysis to other dimensions of non-cognitive output.

References

- Adams, R. and Wu, M. (2002). *PISA 2000 Technical Report*. Paris, OECD Publishing.
- Afonso, A. and St. Aubyn, M. (2006). "Cross-country efficiency of secondary education provision: A semi-parametric analysis with non-discretionary inputs", *Economic Modelling*, 23(3): 476-491.
- Allen, R., Athanassopoulos, A., Dyson, R.G. and Thanassoulis, E. (1997). "Weights restrictions and value judgements in Data Envelopment Analysis", *Annals of Operations Research*, 73(0): 13-34.
- Atkinson, M. and Hornby G. (2002). *Mental Health Handbook for Schools*. London, Routledge Falmer.
- Banker, R., Charnes, A. and Cooper, W.W. (1984). "Models for estimating technical and scale efficiencies in data envelopment analysis", *Management Science*, 30: 1078-1092.
- Bedi, A.S. and Garg, A. (2000): "The effectiveness of private versus public schools: the case of Indonesia", *Journal of Development Economics*, 61: 463- 494.
- Bessent, A.M. and Bessent, E.W. (1980). "Determining the comparative efficiency of schools through data envelopment analysis", *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 16(2): 57-75.
- Bessent, A.M., Bessent, E.W., Kennington J. and Reagan B. (1982). "An application of mathematical programming to assess productivity in the Houston independent school district", *Management Science*, 28(12): 1355-1367.
- Best, R. (1998). "The Development of Affective Education in England", in Lang, Katz and Menezes (eds.), *Affective Education. A Comparative View*, London, Continuum: 72-84.
- Best, R. (2003). "New bottles for Old Wine? Affective Education and the Citizenship Revolution in English Schools", *Pastoral Care in Education*, 21(4): 14-21.
- Bloom, B.S., Engelhart, M.D., Furst, E.J., Hill, W.H. and Krathwohl, D.R. (1956). *Taxonomy of educational objectives*. New York, David McKay Company.
- Charnes, A., Cooper, W. and Rhodes, E. (1978). "Measuring the efficiency of decision making units", *European Journal of Operational Research*, 2: 429-444.
- Chubb, J.E. and Moe, T.M. (1990). *Politics, Markets and American Schools*. The Brookings Institution, Washington DC.
- Cohn and Geske (1990). *The Economics of Education*, Pergamon Press.
- Cohn, E., Millman, S.D. and Chew, I.-K. (1975). *Input-output analysis in Public Education*, Cambridge, Ballinger Publishing Company.
- Coleman, J. , Hoffer, T. and Kilgore, S. (1982): *High school achievement. Public, catholic and private schools compared*. Basic Books, Inc, Publishers. New York.
- Cooper, W.W., Seiford, L.M. and Zhu, J. (2004). *Handbook on Data Envelopment Analysis*. Ed: Springer. N.Y.
- Dewey, J., Husted, T. and Kenny, L. (2000). "The ineffectiveness of school inputs: a product of misspecification?", *Economics of Education Review*, 19: 27-45.

- Dyson, R.G. and Thanassoulis, E. (1988). "Reducing weight flexibility in Data Envelopment Analysis", *Journal of The Operational Research Society*, 39(6): 563-576.
- Figlio, D.N. and Stone, J.A. (1997): "School choice and student performance. Are private schools really better?". Discussion Paper no. 1141-97. Institute for Research on Poverty.
- Giménez, V., Prior, D. and Thieme, C. (2007). "Technical efficiency, managerial efficiency and Objective-setting in the Educational System: An international comparison", *Journal of the Operational Research Society*, 58(8): 996-1007.
- Goldhaber, D.D. and Brewer, D.J. (1997). "Why don't schools and teachers seem to matter? Assessing the impact of unobservables on educational productivity", *The Journal of Human Resources*, 32(3):505-523.
- Goldhaber, D.D. (1996): "Public and private high schools, is school choice an answer to the productivity problem?", *Economics of Education Review*, 15 (2): 93-109.
- Gonand, F., Joumard, I. and Price, R. (2007). "Public spending efficiency: Institutional indicators in Primary and Secondary Education", Working Paper OCDE ECO/WKP(2007)3, available in: www.oecd.org/eco/working_papers
- Gray, J. (1981). "A competitive Edge: Examination results and the probable limits of Secondary School Effectiveness", *Educational Review*, 33: 25-35.
- Gray, J., Jesson, D. and Jones, B. (1986). "Towards a framework for interpreting school's examination results", in Rogers (ed.) *Education and Social Class*, London, Falmer Press.
- Hanushek, E. (1986). "The Economics of Schooling: Production and Efficiency in Public Schools", *Journal of Economic Literature*, 24: 1141-1177.
- Hanushek, E. (1998). "Conclusions and controversies about the effectiveness of school resources", *Economic Policy Review*, March: 11-27.
- Hargreaves, A., Baglin, E., Henderson, P., Leeson, P. and Tossell, T. (1988). *Personal and Social Education. Choices and Challenges*. Oxford, Blackwell.
- Hedges, L.V., Laine, R.D. and Greenwald, R. (1994). "Does money matter? A meta-analysis of studies of the effects of differential school inputs on student outcomes", *Educational Researcher*, 23 (3): 5-14.
- Janmaat, J.G. (2008). "The Civic Attitudes of Ethnic Minority Youth and the impact of Citizenship Education", *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 34(1): 27-54.
- Jimenez, E., Lockheed, M.E. and Paqueo, V. (1991): "The relative efficiency of private and public schools in developing countries", *The World Bank Research Observer*, 6 (2): 205-218.
- Lang, P.L.F, Katz, Y. and Menezes, I. (Eds.) (1998). *Affective Education. A Comparative View*, London, Continuum.
- Levin, H.M. (1974). "Measuring the efficiency in educational production", *Public Finance Quarterly*, 2: 3-24.

- Madaus, G.F., Kellaghan, T., Rakow, E.A. and King, D.J. (1979). "The sensitivity of measures of school effectiveness", *Harvard Educational Review*, 49(2):207-230.
- Mancebón, M.J. and Muñiz, M.A. (2008). "Private versus Public High Schools in Spain: disentangling managerial and program efficiencies", *Journal of the Operational Research Society*, 59(7): 892- 901
- McCarty, T.A. and Yaisawarng, S. (1993). "Technical efficiency in New Jersey School Districts". In Fried, Lovell and Schmidt (eds.), *The measurement of productive efficiency: Techniques and applications*. Oxford University Press, New York, 271-287.
- Nixon, J., Martín, J., McKeown, P. and Ranson, S. (1996). *Encouraging Learning: Towards a theory of the learning school*. Milton Keynes, Open University Press.
- Pring, R. (1984). *Personal and Social Education in the Curriculum*. Londres, Hodder and Stoughton.
- Rico, A. (1996). "Measuring Outcome in schools", in Smith, P. (ed.) *Measuring Outcome in the Public Sector*, London, Taylor and Francis: 118-134.
- Ryder, J. and Campbell, L. (1988). *Balancing Acts in Personal, Social and Health Education*. London, Routledge.
- Sander, W. (1996): "Catholic grade schools and academic achievement", *Journal of Human Resources*, 31 (3): 540-548.
- Silva Portela, M.C. and Thanassoulis, E. (2001). "Decomposing school and school-type efficiency", *European Journal of Operational Research*, 132: 357-373.
- Smith, P. (1997). "Model misspecification in Data Envelopment Analysis", *Annals of Operations Research*, 73: 233-252.
- Smith, P. and Mayston, D. (1987). "Measuring efficiency in the Public Sector", *OMEGA International Journal of Management Science*, 15(3): 181-189.
- Thanassoulis. E. (2001). *Introduction to the Theory and Application of Data Envelopment Analysis*. Massachusetts. Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Thanassoulis, E. and Dunstan, P. (1994). "Guiding schools to improved performance using data envelopment analysis: an illustration with data from a local education authority", *Journal of the Operational Research Society*, 45(11): 1247-1262.
- Wagner, L. (1977). *The internal efficiency of educational institutions*, Open University Course, Milton Keynes, Open University Press.
- Watkins, C., Lodge, C. and McLaughlin, C. (Eds.) (1991). *Gender and Pastoral Care*. Oxford, Blackwell.
- Williams, T. and Carpenter, P. (1991): "Private schooling and public achievement in Australia", *International Journal of Educational Research*, 5: 411-431.
- Wilson, P.W. (2005). "Efficiency in Education Production among PISA countries with emphasis on transitioning economies", World Bank Working Paper available in: ueg.eerc.kiev.ua/conf/papers/Wilson_Paul.pdf

Worthington, A. (2001). "An empirical survey of frontier efficiency measurement techniques in education", *Education Economics*, 9 (3): 245-268.

FUNDACIÓN DE LAS CAJAS DE AHORROS

DOCUMENTOS DE TRABAJO

Últimos números publicados

- 159/2000 Participación privada en la construcción y explotación de carreteras de peaje
Ginés de Rus, Manuel Romero y Lourdes Trujillo
- 160/2000 Errores y posibles soluciones en la aplicación del *Value at Risk*
Mariano González Sánchez
- 161/2000 Tax neutrality on saving assets. The spanish case before and after the tax reform
Cristina Ruza y de Paz-Curbera
- 162/2000 Private rates of return to human capital in Spain: new evidence
F. Barceinas, J. Oliver-Alonso, J.L. Raymond y J.L. Roig-Sabaté
- 163/2000 El control interno del riesgo. Una propuesta de sistema de límites
riesgo neutral
Mariano González Sánchez
- 164/2001 La evolución de las políticas de gasto de las Administraciones Públicas en los años 90
Alfonso Utrilla de la Hoz y Carmen Pérez Esparrells
- 165/2001 Bank cost efficiency and output specification
Emili Tortosa-Ausina
- 166/2001 Recent trends in Spanish income distribution: A robust picture of falling income inequality
Josep Oliver-Alonso, Xavier Ramos y José Luis Raymond-Bara
- 167/2001 Efectos redistributivos y sobre el bienestar social del tratamiento de las cargas familiares en
el nuevo IRPF
Nuria Badenes Plá, Julio López Laborda, Jorge Onrubia Fernández
- 168/2001 The Effects of Bank Debt on Financial Structure of Small and Medium Firms in some Euro-
pean Countries
Mónica Melle-Hernández
- 169/2001 La política de cohesión de la UE ampliada: la perspectiva de España
Ismael Sanz Labrador
- 170/2002 Riesgo de liquidez de Mercado
Mariano González Sánchez
- 171/2002 Los costes de administración para el afiliado en los sistemas de pensiones basados en cuentas
de capitalización individual: medida y comparación internacional.
José Enrique Devesa Carpio, Rosa Rodríguez Barrera, Carlos Vidal Meliá
- 172/2002 La encuesta continua de presupuestos familiares (1985-1996): descripción, representatividad
y propuestas de metodología para la explotación de la información de los ingresos y el gasto.
Llorenç Pou, Joaquín Alegre
- 173/2002 Modelos paramétricos y no paramétricos en problemas de concesión de tarjetas de crédito.
Rosa Puertas, María Bonilla, Ignacio Olmeda

- 174/2002 Mercado único, comercio intra-industrial y costes de ajuste en las manufacturas españolas.
José Vicente Blanes Cristóbal
- 175/2003 La Administración tributaria en España. Un análisis de la gestión a través de los ingresos y de los gastos.
Juan de Dios Jiménez Aguilera, Pedro Enrique Barrilao González
- 176/2003 The Falling Share of Cash Payments in Spain.
Santiago Carbó Valverde, Rafael López del Paso, David B. Humphrey
Publicado en "Moneda y Crédito" nº 217, pags. 167-189.
- 177/2003 Effects of ATMs and Electronic Payments on Banking Costs: The Spanish Case.
Santiago Carbó Valverde, Rafael López del Paso, David B. Humphrey
- 178/2003 Factors explaining the interest margin in the banking sectors of the European Union.
Joaquín Maudos y Juan Fernández Guevara
- 179/2003 Los planes de stock options para directivos y consejeros y su valoración por el mercado de valores en España.
Mónica Melle Hernández
- 180/2003 Ownership and Performance in Europe and US Banking – A comparison of Commercial, Co-operative & Savings Banks.
Yener Altunbas, Santiago Carbó y Phil Molyneux
- 181/2003 The Euro effect on the integration of the European stock markets.
Mónica Melle Hernández
- 182/2004 In search of complementarity in the innovation strategy: international R&D and external knowledge acquisition.
Bruno Cassiman, Reinhilde Veugelers
- 183/2004 Fijación de precios en el sector público: una aplicación para el servicio municipal de suministro de agua.
M^a Ángeles García Valiñas
- 184/2004 Estimación de la economía sumergida en España: un modelo estructural de variables latentes.
Ángel Alañón Pardo, Miguel Gómez de Antonio
- 185/2004 Causas políticas y consecuencias sociales de la corrupción.
Joan Oriol Prats Cabrera
- 186/2004 Loan bankers' decisions and sensitivity to the audit report using the belief revision model.
Andrés Guiral Contreras and José A. Gonzalo Angulo
- 187/2004 El modelo de Black, Derman y Toy en la práctica. Aplicación al mercado español.
Marta Tolentino García-Abadillo y Antonio Díaz Pérez
- 188/2004 Does market competition make banks perform well?.
Mónica Melle
- 189/2004 Efficiency differences among banks: external, technical, internal, and managerial
Santiago Carbó Valverde, David B. Humphrey y Rafael López del Paso

- 190/2004 Una aproximación al análisis de los costes de la esquizofrenia en España: los modelos jerárquicos bayesianos
F. J. Vázquez-Polo, M. A. Negrín, J. M. Cavasés, E. Sánchez y grupo RIRAG
- 191/2004 Environmental proactivity and business performance: an empirical analysis
Javier González-Benito y Óscar González-Benito
- 192/2004 Economic risk to beneficiaries in notional defined contribution accounts (NDCs)
Carlos Vidal-Meliá, Inmaculada Domínguez-Fabian y José Enrique Devesa-Carpio
- 193/2004 Sources of efficiency gains in port reform: non parametric malmquist decomposition tfp index for Mexico
Antonio Estache, Beatriz Tovar de la Fé y Lourdes Trujillo
- 194/2004 Persistencia de resultados en los fondos de inversión españoles
Alfredo Ciriaco Fernández y Rafael Santamaría Aquilué
- 195/2005 El modelo de revisión de creencias como aproximación psicológica a la formación del juicio del auditor sobre la gestión continuada
Andrés Guiral Contreras y Francisco Esteso Sánchez
- 196/2005 La nueva financiación sanitaria en España: descentralización y prospectiva
David Cantarero Prieto
- 197/2005 A cointegration analysis of the Long-Run supply response of Spanish agriculture to the common agricultural policy
José A. Mendez, Ricardo Mora y Carlos San Juan
- 198/2005 ¿Refleja la estructura temporal de los tipos de interés del mercado español preferencia por la liquidez?
Magdalena Massot Perelló y Juan M. Nave
- 199/2005 Análisis de impacto de los Fondos Estructurales Europeos recibidos por una economía regional: Un enfoque a través de Matrices de Contabilidad Social
M. Carmen Lima y M. Alejandro Cardenete
- 200/2005 Does the development of non-cash payments affect monetary policy transmission?
Santiago Carbó Valverde y Rafael López del Paso
- 201/2005 Firm and time varying technical and allocative efficiency: an application for port cargo handling firms
Ana Rodríguez-Álvarez, Beatriz Tovar de la Fe y Lourdes Trujillo
- 202/2005 Contractual complexity in strategic alliances
Jeffrey J. Reuer y Africa Ariño
- 203/2005 Factores determinantes de la evolución del empleo en las empresas adquiridas por opa
Nuria Alcalde Fradejas y Inés Pérez-Soba Aguilar
- 204/2005 Nonlinear Forecasting in Economics: a comparison between Comprehension Approach versus Learning Approach. An Application to Spanish Time Series
Elena Olmedo, Juan M. Valderas, Ricardo Gimeno and Lorenzo Escot

- 205/2005 Precio de la tierra con presión urbana: un modelo para España
Esther Decimavilla, Carlos San Juan y Stefan Sperlich
- 206/2005 Interregional migration in Spain: a semiparametric analysis
Adolfo Maza y José Villaverde
- 207/2005 Productivity growth in European banking
Carmen Murillo-Melchor, José Manuel Pastor y Emili Tortosa-Ausina
- 208/2005 Explaining Bank Cost Efficiency in Europe: Environmental and Productivity Influences.
Santiago Carbó Valverde, David B. Humphrey y Rafael López del Paso
- 209/2005 La elasticidad de sustitución intertemporal con preferencias no separables intratemporalmente: los casos de Alemania, España y Francia.
Elena Márquez de la Cruz, Ana R. Martínez Cañete y Inés Pérez-Soba Aguilar
- 210/2005 Contribución de los efectos tamaño, book-to-market y momentum a la valoración de activos: el caso español.
Begoña Font-Belaire y Alfredo Juan Grau-Grau
- 211/2005 Permanent income, convergence and inequality among countries
José M. Pastor and Lorenzo Serrano
- 212/2005 The Latin Model of Welfare: Do 'Insertion Contracts' Reduce Long-Term Dependence?
Luis Ayala and Magdalena Rodríguez
- 213/2005 The effect of geographic expansion on the productivity of Spanish savings banks
Manuel Illueca, José M. Pastor and Emili Tortosa-Ausina
- 214/2005 Dynamic network interconnection under consumer switching costs
Ángel Luis López Rodríguez
- 215/2005 La influencia del entorno socioeconómico en la realización de estudios universitarios: una aproximación al caso español en la década de los noventa
Marta Rahona López
- 216/2005 The valuation of spanish ipos: efficiency analysis
Susana Álvarez Otero
- 217/2005 On the generation of a regular multi-input multi-output technology using parametric output distance functions
Sergio Perelman and Daniel Santin
- 218/2005 La gobernanza de los procesos parlamentarios: la organización industrial del congreso de los diputados en España
Gonzalo Caballero Miguez
- 219/2005 Determinants of bank market structure: Efficiency and political economy variables
Francisco González
- 220/2005 Agresividad de las órdenes introducidas en el mercado español: estrategias, determinantes y medidas de performance
David Abad Díaz

- 221/2005 Tendencia post-anuncio de resultados contables: evidencia para el mercado español
Carlos Forner Rodríguez, Joaquín Marhuenda Fructuoso y Sonia Sanabria García
- 222/2005 Human capital accumulation and geography: empirical evidence in the European Union
Jesús López-Rodríguez, J. Andrés Faiña y Jose Lopez Rodríguez
- 223/2005 Auditors' Forecasting in Going Concern Decisions: Framing, Confidence and Information Processing
Waymond Rodgers and Andrés Guiral
- 224/2005 The effect of Structural Fund spending on the Galician region: an assessment of the 1994-1999 and 2000-2006 Galician CSFs
José Ramón Cancelo de la Torre, J. Andrés Faiña and Jesús López-Rodríguez
- 225/2005 The effects of ownership structure and board composition on the audit committee activity: Spanish evidence
Carlos Fernández Méndez and Rubén Arrondo García
- 226/2005 Cross-country determinants of bank income smoothing by managing loan loss provisions
Ana Rosa Fonseca and Francisco González
- 227/2005 Incumplimiento fiscal en el irpf (1993-2000): un análisis de sus factores determinantes
Alejandro Estellér Moré
- 228/2005 Region versus Industry effects: volatility transmission
Pilar Soriano Felipe and Francisco J. Climent Diranzo
- 229/2005 Concurrent Engineering: The Moderating Effect Of Uncertainty On New Product Development Success
Daniel Vázquez-Bustelo and Sandra Valle
- 230/2005 On zero lower bound traps: a framework for the analysis of monetary policy in the 'age' of central banks
Alfonso Palacio-Vera
- 231/2005 Reconciling Sustainability and Discounting in Cost Benefit Analysis: a methodological proposal
M. Carmen Almansa Sáez and Javier Calatrava Requena
- 232/2005 Can The Excess Of Liquidity Affect The Effectiveness Of The European Monetary Policy?
Santiago Carbó Valverde and Rafael López del Paso
- 233/2005 Inheritance Taxes In The Eu Fiscal Systems: The Present Situation And Future Perspectives.
Miguel Angel Barberán Lahuerta
- 234/2006 Bank Ownership And Informativeness Of Earnings.
Víctor M. González
- 235/2006 Developing A Predictive Method: A Comparative Study Of The Partial Least Squares Vs Maximum Likelihood Techniques.
Waymond Rodgers, Paul Pavlou and Andres Guiral.
- 236/2006 Using Compromise Programming for Macroeconomic Policy Making in a General Equilibrium Framework: Theory and Application to the Spanish Economy.
Francisco J. André, M. Alejandro Cardenete y Carlos Romero.

- 237/2006 Bank Market Power And Sme Financing Constraints.
Santiago Carbó-Valverde, Francisco Rodríguez-Fernández y Gregory F. Udell.
- 238/2006 Trade Effects Of Monetary Agreements: Evidence For Oecd Countries.
Salvador Gil-Pareja, Rafael Llorca-Vivero y José Antonio Martínez-Serrano.
- 239/2006 The Quality Of Institutions: A Genetic Programming Approach.
Marcos Álvarez-Díaz y Gonzalo Caballero Miguez.
- 240/2006 La interacción entre el éxito competitivo y las condiciones del mercado doméstico como determinantes de la decisión de exportación en las Pymes.
Francisco García Pérez.
- 241/2006 Una estimación de la depreciación del capital humano por sectores, por ocupación y en el tiempo.
Inés P. Murillo.
- 242/2006 Consumption And Leisure Externalities, Economic Growth And Equilibrium Efficiency.
Manuel A. Gómez.
- 243/2006 Measuring efficiency in education: an analysis of different approaches for incorporating non-discretionary inputs.
Jose Manuel Cordero-Ferrera, Francisco Pedraja-Chaparro y Javier Salinas-Jiménez
- 244/2006 Did The European Exchange-Rate Mechanism Contribute To The Integration Of Peripheral Countries?.
Salvador Gil-Pareja, Rafael Llorca-Vivero y José Antonio Martínez-Serrano
- 245/2006 Intergenerational Health Mobility: An Empirical Approach Based On The Echp.
Marta Pascual and David Cantarero
- 246/2006 Measurement and analysis of the Spanish Stock Exchange using the Lyapunov exponent with digital technology.
Salvador Rojí Ferrari and Ana Gonzalez Marcos
- 247/2006 Testing For Structural Breaks In Variance With additive Outliers And Measurement Errors.
Paulo M.M. Rodrigues and Antonio Rubia
- 248/2006 The Cost Of Market Power In Banking: Social Welfare Loss Vs. Cost Inefficiency.
Joaquín Maudos and Juan Fernández de Guevara
- 249/2006 Elasticidades de largo plazo de la demanda de vivienda: evidencia para España (1885-2000).
Desiderio Romero Jordán, José Félix Sanz Sanz y César Pérez López
- 250/2006 Regional Income Disparities in Europe: What role for location?.
Jesús López-Rodríguez and J. Andrés Faña
- 251/2006 Funciones abreviadas de bienestar social: Una forma sencilla de simultaneizar la medición de la eficiencia y la equidad de las políticas de gasto público.
Nuria Badenes Plá y Daniel Santín González
- 252/2006 "The momentum effect in the Spanish stock market: Omitted risk factors or investor behaviour?".
Luis Muga and Rafael Santamaría
- 253/2006 Dinámica de precios en el mercado español de gasolina: un equilibrio de colusión tácita.
Jordi Perdiguero García

- 254/2006 Desigualdad regional en España: renta permanente versus renta corriente.
José M. Pastor, Empar Pons y Lorenzo Serrano
- 255/2006 Environmental implications of organic food preferences: an application of the impure public goods model.
Ana Maria Aldanondo-Ochoa y Carmen Almansa-Sáez
- 256/2006 Family tax credits versus family allowances when labour supply matters: Evidence for Spain.
José Felix Sanz-Sanz, Desiderio Romero-Jordán y Santiago Álvarez-García
- 257/2006 La internacionalización de la empresa manufacturera española: efectos del capital humano genérico y específico.
José López Rodríguez
- 258/2006 Evaluación de las migraciones interregionales en España, 1996-2004.
María Martínez Torres
- 259/2006 Efficiency and market power in Spanish banking.
Rolf Färe, Shawna Grosskopf y Emili Tortosa-Ausina.
- 260/2006 Asimetrías en volatilidad, beta y contagios entre las empresas grandes y pequeñas cotizadas en la bolsa española.
Helena Chuliá y Hipòlit Torró.
- 261/2006 Birth Replacement Ratios: New Measures of Period Population Replacement.
José Antonio Ortega.
- 262/2006 Accidentes de tráfico, víctimas mortales y consumo de alcohol.
José M^a Arranz y Ana I. Gil.
- 263/2006 Análisis de la Presencia de la Mujer en los Consejos de Administración de las Mil Mayores Empresas Españolas.
Ruth Mateos de Cabo, Lorenzo Escot Mangas y Ricardo Gimeno Nogués.
- 264/2006 Crisis y Reforma del Pacto de Estabilidad y Crecimiento. Las Limitaciones de la Política Económica en Europa.
Ignacio Álvarez Peralta.
- 265/2006 Have Child Tax Allowances Affected Family Size? A Microdata Study For Spain (1996-2000).
Jaime Vallés-Giménez y Anabel Zárate-Marco.
- 266/2006 Health Human Capital And The Shift From Foraging To Farming.
Paolo Rungo.
- 267/2006 Financiación Autonómica y Política de la Competencia: El Mercado de Gasolina en Canarias.
Juan Luis Jiménez y Jordi Perdiguero.
- 268/2006 El cumplimiento del Protocolo de Kyoto para los hogares españoles: el papel de la imposición sobre la energía.
Desiderio Romero-Jordán y José Félix Sanz-Sanz.
- 269/2006 Banking competition, financial dependence and economic growth
Joaquín Maudos y Juan Fernández de Guevara
- 270/2006 Efficiency, subsidies and environmental adaptation of animal farming under CAP
Werner Kleinhanß, Carmen Murillo, Carlos San Juan y Stefan Sperlich

- 271/2006 Interest Groups, Incentives to Cooperation and Decision-Making Process in the European Union
A. Garcia-Lorenzo y Jesús López-Rodríguez
- 272/2006 Riesgo asimétrico y estrategias de momentum en el mercado de valores español
Luis Muga y Rafael Santamaría
- 273/2006 Valoración de capital-riesgo en proyectos de base tecnológica e innovadora a través de la teoría de opciones reales
Gracia Rubio Martín
- 274/2006 Capital stock and unemployment: searching for the missing link
Ana Rosa Martínez-Cañete, Elena Márquez de la Cruz, Alfonso Palacio-Vera and Inés Pérez-Soba Aguilar
- 275/2006 Study of the influence of the voters' political culture on vote decision through the simulation of a political competition problem in Spain
Sagrario Lantarón, Isabel Lillo, M^a Dolores López and Javier Rodrigo
- 276/2006 Investment and growth in Europe during the Golden Age
Antonio Cubel and M^a Teresa Sanchis
- 277/2006 Efectos de vincular la pensión pública a la inversión en cantidad y calidad de hijos en un modelo de equilibrio general
Robert Meneu Gaya
- 278/2006 El consumo y la valoración de activos
Elena Márquez y Belén Nieto
- 279/2006 Economic growth and currency crisis: A real exchange rate entropic approach
David Matesanz Gómez y Guillermo J. Ortega
- 280/2006 Three measures of returns to education: An illustration for the case of Spain
María Arrazola y José de Hevia
- 281/2006 Composition of Firms versus Composition of Jobs
Antoni Cunyat
- 282/2006 La vocación internacional de un holding tranviario belga: la Compagnie Mutuelle de Tramways, 1895-1918
Alberte Martínez López
- 283/2006 Una visión panorámica de las entidades de crédito en España en la última década.
Constantino García Ramos
- 284/2006 Foreign Capital and Business Strategies: a comparative analysis of urban transport in Madrid and Barcelona, 1871-1925
Alberte Martínez López
- 285/2006 Los intereses belgas en la red ferroviaria catalana, 1890-1936
Alberte Martínez López
- 286/2006 The Governance of Quality: The Case of the Agrifood Brand Names
Marta Fernández Barcala, Manuel González-Díaz y Emmanuel Raynaud
- 287/2006 Modelling the role of health status in the transition out of malthusian equilibrium
Paolo Rungo, Luis Currais and Berta Rivera
- 288/2006 Industrial Effects of Climate Change Policies through the EU Emissions Trading Scheme
Xavier Labandeira and Miguel Rodríguez

- 289/2006 Globalisation and the Composition of Government Spending: An analysis for OECD countries
Norman Gemmell, Richard Kneller and Ismael Sanz
- 290/2006 La producción de energía eléctrica en España: Análisis económico de la actividad tras la liberalización del Sector Eléctrico
Fernando Hernández Martínez
- 291/2006 Further considerations on the link between adjustment costs and the productivity of R&D investment: evidence for Spain
Desiderio Romero-Jordán, José Félix Sanz-Sanz and Inmaculada Álvarez-Ayuso
- 292/2006 Una teoría sobre la contribución de la función de compras al rendimiento empresarial
Javier González Benito
- 293/2006 Agility drivers, enablers and outcomes: empirical test of an integrated agile manufacturing model
Daniel Vázquez-Bustelo, Lucía Avella and Esteban Fernández
- 294/2006 Testing the parametric vs the semiparametric generalized mixed effects models
María José Lombardía and Stefan Sperlich
- 295/2006 Nonlinear dynamics in energy futures
Mariano Matilla-García
- 296/2006 Estimating Spatial Models By Generalized Maximum Entropy Or How To Get Rid Of W
Esteban Fernández Vázquez, Matías Mayor Fernández and Jorge Rodríguez-Valez
- 297/2006 Optimización fiscal en las transmisiones lucrativas: análisis metodológico
Félix Domínguez Barrero
- 298/2006 La situación actual de la banca online en España
Francisco José Climent Diranzo y Alexandre Momparler Pechuán
- 299/2006 Estrategia competitiva y rendimiento del negocio: el papel mediador de la estrategia y las capacidades productivas
Javier González Benito y Isabel Suárez González
- 300/2006 A Parametric Model to Estimate Risk in a Fixed Income Portfolio
Pilar Abad and Sonia Benito
- 301/2007 Análisis Empírico de las Preferencias Sociales Respecto del Gasto en Obra Social de las Cajas de Ahorros
Alejandro Esteller-Moré, Jonathan Jorba Jiménez y Albert Solé-Ollé
- 302/2007 Assessing the enlargement and deepening of regional trading blocs: The European Union case
Salvador Gil-Pareja, Rafael Llorca-Vivero y José Antonio Martínez-Serrano
- 303/2007 ¿Es la Franquicia un Medio de Financiación?: Evidencia para el Caso Español
Vanessa Solís Rodríguez y Manuel González Díaz
- 304/2007 On the Finite-Sample Biases in Nonparametric Testing for Variance Constancy
Paulo M.M. Rodrigues and Antonio Rubia
- 305/2007 Spain is Different: Relative Wages 1989-98
José Antonio Carrasco Gallego

- 306/2007 Poverty reduction and SAM multipliers: An evaluation of public policies in a regional framework
Francisco Javier De Miguel-Vélez y Jesús Pérez-Mayo
- 307/2007 La Eficiencia en la Gestión del Riesgo de Crédito en las Cajas de Ahorro
Marcelino Martínez Cabrera
- 308/2007 Optimal environmental policy in transport: unintended effects on consumers' generalized price
M. Pilar Socorro and Ofelia Betancor
- 309/2007 Agricultural Productivity in the European Regions: Trends and Explanatory Factors
Roberto Ezcurra, Belen Iraizoz, Pedro Pascual and Manuel Rapún
- 310/2007 Long-run Regional Population Divergence and Modern Economic Growth in Europe: a Case Study of Spain
María Isabel Ayuda, Fernando Collantes and Vicente Pinilla
- 311/2007 Financial Information effects on the measurement of Commercial Banks' Efficiency
Borja Amor, María T. Tascón and José L. Fanjul
- 312/2007 Neutralidad e incentivos de las inversiones financieras en el nuevo IRPF
Félix Domínguez Barrero
- 313/2007 The Effects of Corporate Social Responsibility Perceptions on The Valuation of Common Stock
Waymond Rodgers , Helen Choy and Andres Guiral-Contreras
- 314/2007 Country Creditor Rights, Information Sharing and Commercial Banks' Profitability Persistence across the world
Borja Amor, María T. Tascón and José L. Fanjul
- 315/2007 ¿Es Relevante el Déficit Corriente en una Unión Monetaria? El Caso Español
Javier Blanco González y Ignacio del Rosal Fernández
- 316/2007 The Impact of Credit Rating Announcements on Spanish Corporate Fixed Income Performance: Returns, Yields and Liquidity
Pilar Abad, Antonio Díaz and M. Dolores Robles
- 317/2007 Indicadores de Lealtad al Establecimiento y Formato Comercial Basados en la Distribución del Presupuesto
Cesar Augusto Bustos Reyes y Óscar González Benito
- 318/2007 Migrants and Market Potential in Spain over The XXth Century: A Test Of The New Economic Geography
Daniel A. Tirado, Jordi Pons, Elisenda Paluzie and Javier Silvestre
- 319/2007 El Impacto del Coste de Oportunidad de la Actividad Emprendedora en la Intención de los Ciudadanos Europeos de Crear Empresas
Luis Miguel Zapico Aldeano
- 320/2007 Los belgas y los ferrocarriles de vía estrecha en España, 1887-1936
Alberte Martínez López
- 321/2007 Competición política bipartidista. Estudio geométrico del equilibrio en un caso ponderado
Isabel Lillo, M^a Dolores López y Javier Rodrigo
- 322/2007 Human resource management and environment management systems: an empirical study
M^a Concepción López Fernández, Ana M^a Serrano Bedía and Gema García Piqueres

- 323/2007 Wood and industrialization. evidence and hypotheses from the case of Spain, 1860-1935.
Iñaki Iriarte-Goñi and María Isabel Ayuda Bosque
- 324/2007 New evidence on long-run monetary neutrality.
J. Cunado, L.A. Gil-Alana and F. Perez de Gracia
- 325/2007 Monetary policy and structural changes in the volatility of us interest rates.
Juncal Cuñado, Javier Gomez Biscarri and Fernando Perez de Gracia
- 326/2007 The productivity effects of intrafirm diffusion.
Lucio Fuentelsaz, Jaime Gómez and Sergio Palomas
- 327/2007 Unemployment duration, layoffs and competing risks.
J.M. Arranz, C. García-Serrano and L. Toharia
- 328/2007 El grado de cobertura del gasto público en España respecto a la UE-15
Nuria Rueda, Begoña Barruso, Carmen Calderón y M^a del Mar Herrador
- 329/2007 The Impact of Direct Subsidies in Spain before and after the CAP'92 Reform
Carmen Murillo, Carlos San Juan and Stefan Sperlich
- 330/2007 Determinants of post-privatisation performance of Spanish divested firms
Laura Cabeza García and Silvia Gómez Ansón
- 331/2007 ¿Por qué deciden diversificar las empresas españolas? Razones oportunistas versus razones económicas
Almudena Martínez Campillo
- 332/2007 Dynamical Hierarchical Tree in Currency Markets
Juan Gabriel Brida, David Matesanz Gómez and Wiston Adrián Risso
- 333/2007 Los determinantes sociodemográficos del gasto sanitario. Análisis con microdatos individuales
Ana María Angulo, Ramón Barberán, Pilar Egea y Jesús Mur
- 334/2007 Why do companies go private? The Spanish case
Inés Pérez-Soba Aguilar
- 335/2007 The use of gis to study transport for disabled people
Verónica Cañal Fernández
- 336/2007 The long run consequences of M&A: An empirical application
Cristina Bernad, Lucio Fuentelsaz and Jaime Gómez
- 337/2007 Las clasificaciones de materias en economía: principios para el desarrollo de una nueva clasificación
Valentín Edo Hernández
- 338/2007 Reforming Taxes and Improving Health: A Revenue-Neutral Tax Reform to Eliminate Medical and Pharmaceutical VAT
Santiago Álvarez-García, Carlos Pestana Barros y Juan Prieto-Rodríguez
- 339/2007 Impacts of an iron and steel plant on residential property values
Celia Bilbao-Terol
- 340/2007 Firm size and capital structure: Evidence using dynamic panel data
Victor M. González and Francisco González

- 341/2007 ¿Cómo organizar una cadena hotelera? La elección de la forma de gobierno
Marta Fernández Barcala y Manuel González Díaz
- 342/2007 Análisis de los efectos de la decisión de diversificar: un contraste del marco teórico “Agencia-Stewardship”
Almudena Martínez Campillo y Roberto Fernández Gago
- 343/2007 Selecting portfolios given multiple eurostoxx-based uncertainty scenarios: a stochastic goal programming approach from fuzzy betas
Enrique Ballester, Blanca Pérez-Gladish, Mar Arenas-Parra and Amelia Bilbao-Terol
- 344/2007 “El bienestar de los inmigrantes y los factores implicados en la decisión de emigrar”
Anastasia Hernández Alemán y Carmelo J. León
- 345/2007 Governance Decisions in the R&D Process: An Integrative Framework Based on TCT and Knowledge View of The Firm.
Andrea Martínez-Noya and Esteban García-Canal
- 346/2007 Diferencias salariales entre empresas públicas y privadas. El caso español
Begoña Cueto y Nuria Sánchez- Sánchez
- 347/2007 Effects of Fiscal Treatments of Second Home Ownership on Renting Supply
Celia Bilbao Terol and Juan Prieto Rodríguez
- 348/2007 Auditors’ ethical dilemmas in the going concern evaluation
Andres Guiral, Waymond Rodgers, Emiliano Ruiz and Jose A. Gonzalo
- 349/2007 Convergencia en capital humano en España. Un análisis regional para el periodo 1970-2004
Susana Morales Sequera y Carmen Pérez Esparrells
- 350/2007 Socially responsible investment: mutual funds portfolio selection using fuzzy multiobjective programming
Blanca M^a Pérez-Gladish, Mar Arenas-Parra , Amelia Bilbao-Terol and M^a Victoria Rodríguez-Uría
- 351/2007 Persistencia del resultado contable y sus componentes: implicaciones de la medida de ajustes por devengo
Raúl Iñiguez Sánchez y Francisco Poveda Fuentes
- 352/2007 Wage Inequality and Globalisation: What can we Learn from the Past? A General Equilibrium Approach
Concha Betrán, Javier Ferri and Maria A. Pons
- 353/2007 Eficacia de los incentivos fiscales a la inversión en I+D en España en los años noventa
Desiderio Romero Jordán y José Félix Sanz Sanz
- 354/2007 Convergencia regional en renta y bienestar en España
Robert Meneu Gaya
- 355/2007 Tributación ambiental: Estado de la Cuestión y Experiencia en España
Ana Carrera Poncela
- 356/2007 Salient features of dependence in daily us stock market indices
Luis A. Gil-Alana, Juncal Cuñado and Fernando Pérez de Gracia
- 357/2007 La educación superior: ¿un gasto o una inversión rentable para el sector público?
Inés P. Murillo y Francisco Pedraja

- 358/2007 Effects of a reduction of working hours on a model with job creation and job destruction
Emilio Domínguez, Miren Ullibarri y Idoya Zabaleta
- 359/2007 Stock split size, signaling and earnings management: Evidence from the Spanish market
José Yagüe, J. Carlos Gómez-Sala and Francisco Poveda-Fuentes
- 360/2007 Modelización de las expectativas y estrategias de inversión en mercados de derivados
Begoña Font-Belaire
- 361/2008 Trade in capital goods during the golden age, 1953-1973
M^a Teresa Sanchis and Antonio Cubel
- 362/2008 El capital económico por riesgo operacional: una aplicación del modelo de distribución de pérdidas
Enrique José Jiménez Rodríguez y José Manuel Fera Domínguez
- 363/2008 The drivers of effectiveness in competition policy
Joan-Ramon Borrell and Juan-Luis Jiménez
- 364/2008 Corporate governance structure and board of directors remuneration policies: evidence from Spain
Carlos Fernández Méndez, Rubén Arrondo García and Enrique Fernández Rodríguez
- 365/2008 Beyond the disciplinary role of governance: how boards and donors add value to Spanish foundations
Pablo De Andrés Alonso, Valentín Azofra Palenzuela y M. Elena Romero Merino
- 366/2008 Complejidad y perfeccionamiento contractual para la contención del oportunismo en los acuerdos de franquicia
Vanessa Solís Rodríguez y Manuel González Díaz
- 367/2008 Inestabilidad y convergencia entre las regiones europeas
Jesús Mur, Fernando López y Ana Angulo
- 368/2008 Análisis espacial del cierre de explotaciones agrarias
Ana Aldanondo Ochoa, Carmen Almansa Sáez y Valero Casanovas Oliva
- 369/2008 Cross-Country Efficiency Comparison between Italian and Spanish Public Universities in the period 2000-2005
Tommaso Agasisti and Carmen Pérez Esparrells
- 370/2008 El desarrollo de la sociedad de la información en España: un análisis por comunidades autónomas
María Concepción García Jiménez y José Luis Gómez Barroso
- 371/2008 El medioambiente y los objetivos de fabricación: un análisis de los modelos estratégicos para su consecución
Lucía Avella Camarero, Esteban Fernández Sánchez y Daniel Vázquez-Bustelo
- 372/2008 Influence of bank concentration and institutions on capital structure: New international evidence
Víctor M. González and Francisco González
- 373/2008 Generalización del concepto de equilibrio en juegos de competición política
M^a Dolores López González y Javier Rodrigo Hitos
- 374/2008 Smooth Transition from Fixed Effects to Mixed Effects Models in Multi-level regression Models
María José Lombardía and Stefan Sperlich

- 375/2008 A Revenue-Neutral Tax Reform to Increase Demand for Public Transport Services
Carlos Pestana Barros and Juan Prieto-Rodríguez
- 376/2008 Measurement of intra-distribution dynamics: An application of different approaches to the European regions
Adolfo Maza, María Hierro and José Villaverde
- 377/2008 Migración interna de extranjeros y ¿nueva fase en la convergencia?
María Hierro y Adolfo Maza
- 378/2008 Efectos de la Reforma del Sector Eléctrico: Modelización Teórica y Experiencia Internacional
Ciro Eduardo Bazán Navarro
- 379/2008 A Non-Parametric Independence Test Using Permutation Entropy
Mariano Matilla-García and Manuel Ruiz Marín
- 380/2008 Testing for the General Fractional Unit Root Hypothesis in the Time Domain
Uwe Hassler, Paulo M.M. Rodrigues and Antonio Rubia
- 381/2008 Multivariate gram-charlier densities
Esther B. Del Brio, Trino-Manuel Níguez and Javier Perote
- 382/2008 Analyzing Semiparametrically the Trends in the Gender Pay Gap - The Example of Spain
Ignacio Moral-Arce, Stefan Sperlich, Ana I. Fernández-Saínz and Maria J. Roca
- 383/2008 A Cost-Benefit Analysis of a Two-Sided Card Market
Santiago Carbó Valverde, David B. Humphrey, José Manuel Liñares Zegarra and Francisco Rodríguez Fernández
- 384/2008 A Fuzzy Bicriteria Approach for Journal Deselection in a Hospital Library
M. L. López-Avello, M. V. Rodríguez-Uría, B. Pérez-Gladish, A. Bilbao-Terol, M. Arenas-Parra
- 385/2008 Valoración de las grandes corporaciones farmacéuticas, a través del análisis de sus principales intangibles, con el método de opciones reales
Gracia Rubio Martín y Prosper Lamothe Fernández
- 386/2008 El marketing interno como impulsor de las habilidades comerciales de las pyme españolas: efectos en los resultados empresariales
M^a Leticia Santos Vijande, M^a José Sanzo Pérez, Nuria García Rodríguez y Juan A. Trespalacios Gutiérrez
- 387/2008 Understanding Warrants Pricing: A case study of the financial market in Spain
David Abad y Belén Nieto
- 388/2008 Aglomeración espacial, Potencial de Mercado y Geografía Económica: Una revisión de la literatura
Jesús López-Rodríguez y J. Andrés Faíña
- 389/2008 An empirical assessment of the impact of switching costs and first mover advantages on firm performance
Jaime Gómez, Juan Pablo Maícas
- 390/2008 Tender offers in Spain: testing the wave
Ana R. Martínez-Cañete y Inés Pérez-Soba Aguilar

- 391/2008 La integración del mercado español a finales del siglo XIX: los precios del trigo entre 1891 y 1905
Mariano Matilla García, Pedro Pérez Pascual y Basilio Sanz Carnero
- 392/2008 Cuando el tamaño importa: estudio sobre la influencia de los sujetos políticos en la balanza de bienes y servicios
Alfonso Echazarra de Gregorio
- 393/2008 Una visión cooperativa de las medidas ante el posible daño ambiental de la desalación
Borja Montaña Sanz
- 394/2008 Efectos externos del endeudamiento sobre la calificación crediticia de las Comunidades Autónomas
Andrés Leal Marcos y Julio López Laborda
- 395/2008 Technical efficiency and productivity changes in Spanish airports: A parametric distance functions approach
Beatriz Tovar & Roberto Rendeiro Martín-Cejas
- 396/2008 Network analysis of exchange data: Interdependence drives crisis contagion
David Matesanz Gómez & Guillermo J. Ortega
- 397/2008 Explaining the performance of Spanish privatised firms: a panel data approach
Laura Cabeza Garcia and Silvia Gomez Anson
- 398/2008 Technological capabilities and the decision to outsource R&D services
Andrea Martínez-Noya and Esteban García-Canal
- 399/2008 Hybrid Risk Adjustment for Pharmaceutical Benefits
Manuel García-Goñi, Pere Ibern & José María Inoriza
- 400/2008 The Team Consensus–Performance Relationship and the Moderating Role of Team Diversity
José Henríque Dieguez, Javier González-Benito and Jesús Galende
- 401/2008 The institutional determinants of CO₂ emissions: A computational modelling approach using Artificial Neural Networks and Genetic Programming
Marcos Álvarez-Díaz , Gonzalo Caballero Miguez and Mario Soliño
- 402/2008 Alternative Approaches to Include Exogenous Variables in DEA Measures: A Comparison Using Monte Carlo
José Manuel Cordero-Ferrera, Francisco Pedraja-Chaparro and Daniel Santín-González
- 403/2008 Efecto diferencial del capital humano en el crecimiento económico andaluz entre 1985 y 2004: comparación con el resto de España
M^a del Pópulo Pablo-Romero Gil-Delgado y M^a de la Palma Gómez-Calero Valdés
- 404/2008 Análisis de fusiones, variaciones conjeturales y la falacia del estimador en diferencias
Juan Luis Jiménez y Jordi Perdiguero
- 405/2008 Política fiscal en la ue: ¿basta con los estabilizadores automáticos?
Jorge Uxó González y M^a Jesús Arroyo Fernández
- 406/2008 Papel de la orientación emprendedora y la orientación al mercado en el éxito de las empresas
Óscar González-Benito, Javier González-Benito y Pablo A. Muñoz-Gallego
- 407/2008 La presión fiscal por impuesto sobre sociedades en la unión europea
Elena Fernández Rodríguez, Antonio Martínez Arias y Santiago Álvarez García

- 408/2008 The environment as a determinant factor of the purchasing and supply strategy: an empirical analysis
Dr. Javier González-Benito y MS Duilio Reis da Rocha
- 409/2008 Cooperation for innovation: the impact on innovatory effort
Gloria Sánchez González and Liliana Herrera
- 410/2008 Spanish post-earnings announcement drift and behavioral finance models
Carlos Forner and Sonia Sanabria
- 411/2008 Decision taking with external pressure: evidence on football manager dismissals in argentina and their consequences
Ramón Flores, David Forrest and Juan de Dios Tena
- 412/2008 Comercio agrario latinoamericano, 1963-2000: aplicación de la ecuación gravitacional para flujos desagregados de comercio
Raúl Serrano y Vicente Pinilla
- 413/2008 Voter heuristics in Spain: a descriptive approach elector decision
José Luís Sáez Lozano and Antonio M. Jaime Castillo
- 414/2008 Análisis del efecto área de salud de residencia sobre la utilización y acceso a los servicios sanitarios en la Comunidad Autónoma Canaria
Ignacio Abásolo Alessón, Lidia García Pérez, Raquel Aguiar Ibáñez y Asier Amador Robayna
- 415/2008 Impact on competitive balance from allowing foreign players in a sports league: an analytical model and an empirical test
Ramón Flores, David Forrest & Juan de Dios Tena
- 416/2008 Organizational innovation and productivity growth: Assessing the impact of outsourcing on firm performance
Alberto López
- 417/2008 Value Efficiency Analysis of Health Systems
Eduardo González, Ana Cárcaba & Juan Ventura
- 418/2008 Equidad en la utilización de servicios sanitarios públicos por comunidades autónomas en España: un análisis multinivel
Ignacio Abásolo, Jaime Pinilla, Miguel Negrín, Raquel Aguiar y Lidia García
- 419/2008 Piedras en el camino hacia Bolonia: efectos de la implantación del EEES sobre los resultados académicos
Carmen Florido, Juan Luis Jiménez e Isabel Santana
- 420/2008 The welfare effects of the allocation of airlines to different terminals
M. Pilar Socorro and Ofelia Betancor
- 421/2008 How bank capital buffers vary across countries. The influence of cost of deposits, market power and bank regulation
Ana Rosa Fonseca and Francisco González
- 422/2008 Analysing health limitations in Spain: an empirical approach based on the European Community household panel
Marta Pascual and David Cantarero

- 423/2008 Regional productivity variation and the impact of public capital stock: an analysis with spatial interaction, with reference to Spain
Miguel Gómez-Antonio and Bernard Fingleton
- 424/2008 Average effect of training programs on the time needed to find a job. The case of the training schools program in the south of Spain (Seville, 1997-1999).
José Manuel Cansino Muñoz-Repiso and Antonio Sánchez Braza
- 425/2008 Medición de la eficiencia y cambio en la productividad de las empresas distribuidoras de electricidad en Perú después de las reformas
Raúl Pérez-Reyes y Beatriz Tovar
- 426/2008 Acercando posturas sobre el descuento ambiental: sondeo Delphi a expertos en el ámbito internacional
Carmen Almansa Sáez y José Miguel Martínez Paz
- 427/2008 Determinants of abnormal liquidity after rating actions in the Corporate Debt Market
Pilar Abad, Antonio Díaz and M. Dolores Robles
- 428/2008 Export led-growth and balance of payments constrained. New formalization applied to Cuban commercial regimes since 1960
David Matesanz Gómez, Guadalupe Fugarolas Álvarez-Ude and Isis Mañalich Gálvez
- 429/2008 La deuda implícita y el desequilibrio financiero-actuarial de un sistema de pensiones. El caso del régimen general de la seguridad social en España
José Enrique Devesa Carpio y Mar Devesa Carpio
- 430/2008 Efectos de la descentralización fiscal sobre el precio de los carburantes en España
Desiderio Romero Jordán, Marta Jorge García-Inés y Santiago Álvarez García
- 431/2008 Euro, firm size and export behavior
Silviano Esteve-Pérez, Salvador Gil-Pareja, Rafael Llorca-Vivero and José Antonio Martínez-Serrano
- 432/2008 Does social spending increase support for free trade in advanced democracies?
Ismael Sanz, Ferran Martínez i Coma and Federico Steinberg
- 433/2008 Potencial de Mercado y Estructura Espacial de Salarios: El Caso de Colombia
Jesús López-Rodríguez y Maria Cecilia Acevedo
- 434/2008 Persistence in Some Energy Futures Markets
Juncal Cunado, Luis A. Gil-Alana and Fernando Pérez de Gracia
- 435/2008 La inserción financiera externa de la economía francesa: inversores institucionales y nueva gestión empresarial
Ignacio Álvarez Peralta
- 436/2008 ¿Flexibilidad o rigidez salarial en España?: un análisis a escala regional
Ignacio Moral Arce y Adolfo Maza Fernández
- 437/2009 Intangible relationship-specific investments and the performance of r&d outsourcing agreements
Andrea Martínez-Noya, Esteban García-Canal & Mauro F. Guillén
- 438/2009 Friendly or Controlling Boards?
Pablo de Andrés Alonso & Juan Antonio Rodríguez Sanz

- 439/2009 La sociedad Trenor y Cía. (1838-1926): un modelo de negocio industrial en la España del siglo XIX
Amparo Ruiz Llopis
- 440/2009 Continental bias in trade
Salvador Gil-Pareja, Rafael Llorca-Vivero & José Antonio Martínez Serrano
- 441/2009 Determining operational capital at risk: an empirical application to the retail banking
Enrique José Jiménez-Rodríguez, José Manuel Feria-Domínguez & José Luis Martín-Marín
- 442/2009 Costes de mitigación y escenarios post-kyoto en España: un análisis de equilibrio general para España
Mikel González Ruiz de Eguino
- 443/2009 Las revistas españolas de economía en las bibliotecas universitarias: ranking, valoración del indicador y del sistema
Valentín Edo Hernández
- 444/2009 Convergencia económica en España y coordinación de políticas económicas. un estudio basado en la estructura productiva de las CC.AA.
Ana Cristina Mingorance Arnáiz
- 445/2009 Instrumentos de mercado para reducir emisiones de co2: un análisis de equilibrio general para España
Mikel González Ruiz de Eguino
- 446/2009 El comercio intra e inter-regional del sector Turismo en España
Carlos Llano y Tamara de la Mata
- 447/2009 Efectos del incremento del precio del petróleo en la economía española: Análisis de cointegración y de la política monetaria mediante reglas de Taylor
Fernando Hernández Martínez
- 448/2009 Bologna Process and Expenditure on Higher Education: A Convergence Analysis of the EU-15
T. Agasisti, C. Pérez Esparrells, G. Catalano & S. Morales
- 449/2009 Global Economy Dynamics? Panel Data Approach to Spillover Effects
Gregory Daco, Fernando Hernández Martínez & Li-Wu Hsu
- 450/2009 Pricing levered warrants with dilution using observable variables
Isabel Abinzano & Javier F. Navas
- 451/2009 Information technologies and financial performance: The effect of technology diffusion among competitors
Lucio Fuentelsaz, Jaime Gómez & Sergio Palomas
- 452/2009 A Detailed Comparison of Value at Risk in International Stock Exchanges
Pilar Abad & Sonia Benito
- 453/2009 Understanding offshoring: has Spain been an offshoring location in the nineties?
Belén González-Díaz & Rosario Gandoy
- 454/2009 Outsourcing decision, product innovation and the spatial dimension: Evidence from the Spanish footwear industry
José Antonio Belso-Martínez

- 455/2009 Does playing several competitions influence a team's league performance? Evidence from Spanish professional football
Andrés J. Picazo-Tadeo & Francisco González-Gómez
- 456/2009 Does accessibility affect retail prices and competition? An empirical application
Juan Luis Jiménez and Jordi Perdiguero
- 457/2009 Cash conversion cycle in smes
Sonia Baños-Caballero, Pedro J. García-Teruel and Pedro Martínez-Solano
- 458/2009 Un estudio sobre el perfil de hogares endeudados y sobreendeudados: el caso de los hogares vascos
Alazne Mujika Alberdi, Iñaki García Arrizabalaga y Juan José Gibaja Martíns
- 459/2009 Imposing monotonicity on outputs in parametric distance function estimations: with an application to the spanish educational production
Sergio Perelman and Daniel Santin
- 460/2009 Key issues when using tax data for concentration analysis: an application to the Spanish wealth tax
José M^a Durán-Cabré and Alejandro Esteller-Moré
- 461/2009 ¿Se está rompiendo el mercado español? Una aplicación del enfoque de feldstein –horioka
Saúl De Vicente Queijeiro, José Luis Pérez Rivero y María Rosalía Vicente Cuervo
- 462/2009 Financial condition, cost efficiency and the quality of local public services
Manuel A. Muñiz & José L. Zafra
- 463/2009 Including non-cognitive outputs in a multidimensional evaluation of education production: an international comparison
Marián García Valiñas & Manuel Antonio Muñiz Pérez